July 7, 2021

Sarah Hanzel
City of Rapid City
Community Development Department
300 6th St
Rapid City SD 57701-5035

RE: SDCL 1-19A-11.1 Consultation
Project: 2106302001S – 1116 9th Street, Rapid City – Replace Siding and 23 Windows
Location: Pennington County
(CORC)

Dear Ms. Hanzel:

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on the above referenced project pursuant to SDCL 1-19A-11.1. The South Dakota Office of the State Historic Preservation Officer (SHPO) would like to provide the following comments concerning effect of the proposed project on the non-renewable cultural resources of South Dakota.

On June 30, 2021 the SHPO received notification of the above-referenced project to replace the siding and 23 windows at 1116 9th Street in Rapid City. 1116 9th Street is a contributing property within the West Boulevard Historic District, which is listed in the National Register of Historic Places. SDCL 1-19A-11.1 outlines a specific process that must be followed prior to any governmental action that may harm any historic property that is included in the National or State Registers of Historic Places.

Based upon the information provided, the existing wood siding would be removed for the installation of continuous insulation and replaced with Hardieplank in the Cedarmill finish. The current wood windows will be replaced with Pella Lifestyle wood clad windows with simulated grills to match the existing muntin patterns. The window and door trim would be replaced 4” boards to match the original and PVC pediment trim.

Given the above, it appears that this project has the potential to encroach upon, damage, or destroy this historic property. The wood siding, windows, and trim are architecturally-significant, character-defining features of this house, and removal of these features will drastically alter the structure’s historic integrity. Specifically, Cedarmill finish HardiePlank and vinyl trim are not visually compatible replacements for the historic wood siding and trim and will have a different textures and thicknesses than the current wood features. Additionally, although the proposed windows seek to recreate the light division of the existing windows, the simulated grills between the panes of glass will alter the visual qualities of the muntin depth provided by true divided lights. Therefore, the
SHPO is requesting an abbreviated case report consistent with ARSD 24:52:07:03, including #1, 2, 7 and 10. For item #10, please have the Rapid City Historic Preservation Commission review and comment on the case report within 180 days of receipt prior to submittal to SHPO.

For item #7, SHPO would like to suggest alternatives to wholesale replacement of the historic wood siding, windows, and trim. The project should ideally seek to retain or salvage any historic materials that are not deteriorated beyond repair. For features where the degree of deterioration warrants replacement, SHPO suggests replacement in kind, where possible. Specifically, SPHO recommends retaining as much original siding as possible and seeking to replace the existing in kind only where it is deteriorated beyond repair. We also recommend replacing only the windows that are significantly deteriorated, and especially retaining the historic windows on the façade if possible. If widows must be replaced, a product that can better replicate the look of the originals with exterior applied muntins will be more visually compatible.

Should you require any additional information, please contact Heather Mulliner at (605) 773-6005 or Heather.Mulliner@state.sd.us.

Sincerely,

Ted M. Spencer
State Historic Preservation Officer

[Signature]
Heather Mulliner
Historic Preservation Specialist
Hi Sarah,

I have attached my letter for this project. We are requesting a case report for this project since they are proposing such extensive removal and replacement of the primary character defining features of this house.

Based on their proposal, it sounds like they are looking for low-maintenance changes that can be accomplished in one fell swoop, but I don’t think there’s any way the current proposal can meet historic preservation standards. Their application noted a number of issue, including needing better insulation/temperature control, moisture control, and the siding not holding paint. These are common problems with historic homes, and the Nation Parks Service has produced some useful preservation briefs that address these issues. I’ve included links to a few of these briefs below. The advice they present would likely require some big adjustments to their current plans, but may be my be useful if they want to explore strategies to preserve these historic features.


If you have any questions let me know.

Best,
Heather

Heather Mulliner
Historic Preservation Specialist
South Dakota State Historical Society
State Historic Preservation Office
900 Governors Drive
Pierre SD 57501-2217
(605) 773-6005

visit our website
Hi Heather,

Attached is information for proposed exterior alterations at 1116 9th Street. Please let me know if you have any questions. Thanks for your comments.

Sarah Hanzel, AICP
Planning Projects Division Manager
Community Development Department
300 Sixth Street
Rapid City, SD 57701
605-394-4120
sarah.hanzel@rcgov.org