

**Case Report for South Dakota State Historical Society
1121 West Boulevard, Rapid City, SD – Pennington County
RE: Construction of New Garage Addition to Existing Garage
June 14, 2019**

Overview

On June 11, 2019 The South Dakota State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) requested an abbreviated case report concerning the proposed two-car garage addition.

The SHPO may be interested to know that one of the applicants designed and constructed a new single-family home (731 16th Street, Des Moines, IA – Polk County) in the Craftsman style in the Sherman Hill Historic District of Des Moines, in accordance with all historic standards and only after a full review by the Des Moines Historic District commission, including city staff. This is mentioned to demonstrate that the applicants have a commitment toward the preservation and enhancement of the historic nature of the property.

1. A description of any impending project which may adversely affect historic property:

A new garage addition is proposed which would adjoin the west side of existing garage. Proposed garage to be constructed in the same style and manner as existing garage, using materials that will mimic the materials used on the existing garage. Additional garage will include two single or double hung windows on the south side, mirroring the two windows that are present on the existing garage. Roof pitch and materials to match existing garage.

2. Photographs, maps, or drawings showing the existing project site, the extent of projects, and the details of the proposed projects;

See additional documents (Sarah Hanzel).

5. A description of potentially affected historic property with any relevant physical, economic, or situational information on the property:

Although the existing garage is original to the property it has been modified at some point over the years. Based on outlines of areas that have likely been patched in, there appear to have been a single-car garage door on the west side of the existing garage with a single or double-hung window next to it. This indicates that alley access to the garage likely existed at one time. Currently there are no openings, doors or windows on the west side of the existing garage. It is unclear whether the single-car garage door and passage door on the east side of the existing garage are original or not.

6. A description of the potential effects of a proposed project on historic property and the basis for the determination of effect:

The proposed development does not meet the Standards for New Construction in Historic Districts (ARSD 24:52:07:04) which state that for compatibility of design “the overall visual appearance of new construction may not dominate or be distracting to the surrounding historic landscape.” Since the proposed addition to the contributing garage is larger than the existing structure, this standard was not found to be met.

**Case Report for South Dakota State Historical Society
1121 West Boulevard, Rapid City, SD – Pennington County
RE: Construction of New Garage Addition to Existing Garage
June 14, 2019**

The applicants believe the proposed addition would enhance the existing historic structures on the property as the addition has been designed to complement the existing garage, from design, to materials, roof pitch and materials, and doors and windows. The addition would actually help enhance the historic nature of the property as it will help achieve a stated desire of historic districts by eliminating a curb cut, reducing paved driveway surface and eliminate surface parking, and finally to restore alley access to parking. (See draft "Design Handbook for the West Boulevard Historic District" dated 6/22/2012). In doing this it would also eliminate run-off and some heat island effect.

An addition will also help with the goal of eliminating surface parking by providing adequate (but not excessive) enclosed parking spaces for applicants' vehicles. The existing historic garage will actually be enhanced as applicants plan to repurpose this structure as covered outdoor living space without any additional exterior modifications. In order to accommodate this desire, applicants will also be restoring the existing wood double hung windows in the existing garage so that they may open and preserve them with storm windows. The existing garage will likely get more care and attention as a covered outdoor living space than it would should it remain a garage.

7. A historic preservation plan or description and evaluation of all feasible and prudent alternatives which a state entity or political subdivision proposes in order to minimize adverse effects of a project on historic property and alternatives which the state entity of political subdivision has examined and rejects:

The applicants' original plan to construct a 23'x24' two-car addition to the existing garage posed concerns that it may encroach upon, damage or destroy historic property. Applicants appreciate this concern as their overall goal is to enhance the historic nature of the property while making it more livable. One of the ways the applicants addressed this concern was by scaling down the size of the proposed two-car addition to 22'x22' so that it will be more compatible with the existing garage.

In consultation with the Rapid City Community Development Department and using the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Treatment of Historic Properties, a number of alternatives were considered by the applicants, including:

Forgoing the proposed addition and repurposing the existing garage to try to accommodate two vehicles.

Potentially two new garage door openings – or one large double-car opening – would have to be created on the west side of the existing garage. There is not space available on the east side of the existing garage to maneuver two vehicles in to the garage, even if there were openings in the garage for such.

As mentioned above in item 5, the original openings (now patched over) on the west side of the existing garage appear to have been for a single-car garage door and a window. It would not be possible to maintain the historical integrity of the existing garage by creating openings for two vehicles on the west side of the existing garage. More concrete would have to be added to the west

**Case Report for South Dakota State Historical Society
1121 West Boulevard, Rapid City, SD – Pennington County
RE: Construction of New Garage Addition to Existing Garage
June 14, 2019**

side of the existing garage from the alley which goes against one of the stated goals for this historic area, a reduction in the amount of driveway. In addition, the existing garage's size – 20'x20' as measured via the building's exterior – does not provide adequate room inside for vehicles of today's size.

Construction of only a one-car garage adjacent to the existing garage.

The applicants desire to repurpose the existing garage as covered outdoor living space and they desire to achieve additional stated historic district goals of reducing driveways, surface parking and street access to driveways and garages. This alternative would not help with those goals.

Construction of a two-car garage that is the same size as the existing garage adjacent to or attached to the existing garage.

The applicants noticed that on an elevation plan, this alternative produced – either practically or just in appearance - a long, single building with little visual interest. The distinctive character of the existing garage also seemed to get lost in this configuration. A two-car garage that is slightly different in size than the existing garage would therefore accent the existing garage, keeping it distinct, versus blending it in to a like-sized addition, causing the original garage to potentially get lost in the mass.

In addition, an unattached but adjacent garage would require firewalls (per the Rapid City Community Development office) and would increase the cost of the proposed addition.

As stated in item 5, above, the west side of the existing garage had been modified at some point, eliminating the door and window that likely previously existed. Therefore, any addition to the existing garage would not harm the historic property as no existing doors, windows or other openings would be affected. If legally permitted, the proposed two-car garage could be added to the existing garage without the construction of a new, additional east wall (i.e., a new wall that would abut the west wall of the existing garage) so that the west wall of the existing garage could remain preserved in its current state. Applicants are willing to do this if building codes allow.

The proposed two-car addition would not be out of character for the surrounding historic area and therefore would have no adverse effect. In fact, many of the neighbors have also enhanced their off-alley parking by adding the same kind of addition applicants are proposing. Three out of the four adjacent homes – all contributing structures in the historic district - on the same block as the property have added these structures, all with alley access. Two of these have done this by adjoining the addition to the existing historic house. And one of these did this by adding a three-car garage. So, the proposed addition would be totally compatible with the historic environment.

Also, the proposed two-car addition would be in what is considered the back corner of the property, remaining secondary to the existing house, located closest to West Boulevard (which is technically the front yard) and secondary to the existing garage.

**Case Report for South Dakota State Historical Society
1121 West Boulevard, Rapid City, SD – Pennington County
RE: Construction of New Garage Addition to Existing Garage
June 14, 2019**

Regarding any concerns that may exist over drainage and the impact of having more covered area on the property vs less, the applicants plan to employ rain collection barrels on downspouts as well as creating gradual graded areas with water tolerant plants/flowers to absorb and utilize any runoff.